

**To:** Naranjo, Eugenia[Naranjo.Eugenia@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Warner, Len[lwarner@louisberger.com]  
**From:** Clifford Firstenberg  
**Sent:** Tue 1/3/2017 6:08:29 PM  
**Subject:** RE: EPA comments on Tierra Fish Data Report

Eugenia – Happy New Year! I hope you enjoyed your travels, family, and time away from work.

We are wrapping-up our RTCs on the Fish Data Report and have one comment that that we don't fully understand. See below:

<b>Comment No.</b>	<b>Section</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>Comment</b>	<b>Tierra Response</b>
16	Table 2-6 (and similarly formatted tables)	Table 2-6 (and similarly formatted tables)	(a) Please add an explanation to Footnote 1 that the fish family is used if samples were not identified to species and explain why this was done.  (b) Please revise Footnote 2 to explain specifically when individuals were not included in the total. Please clarify the meaning of the phrase “if species within family collected by gear”.	(a) We do not understand this comment. Footnote 1 says that the table includes target species that were not needed (sample was already mass attained) or of insufficient size (did not meet the length requirement)  (b) Footnote 2 refers to the last row of the table for total number of species collected with each gear. This statement refers specifically to the Clupeidae collected with trawl (19 species total excluding Clupeidae) as we already counted other clupeids (e.g., American shad is in Clupeidae family), otherwise we would be double counting taxa. Are we misunderstanding the comment?

If you can get LBG (or Battelle) to clarify we can address this one outstanding comment and incorporate it into our pending submittal.

Thanks  
Cliff

Clifford E. Firstenberg  
Principal and Environmental Sciences Manager  
Tierra Solutions, Inc.

E-mail: [cfirstenberg@tierrasolutionsinc.com](mailto:cfirstenberg@tierrasolutionsinc.com)

Phone: 757-282-6462

Cell: 757-206-6281

#### CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE...

The information in this email may be confidential and/or privileged. This email is intended to be reviewed by only the individual or organization named above. If you are not the intended recipient or an authorized representative of the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination or copying of this email and its attachments, if any, or the information contained herein is prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender by return email and delete this email from your system.

Thank You.

-----Original Message-----

From: Naranjo, Eugenia [mailto:Naranjo.Eugenia@epa.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, November 29, 2016 2:40 PM

To: Clifford Firstenberg <cfirstenberg@tierrasolutionsinc.com>

Cc: Carlie Thompson <cthompson@tierrasolutionsinc.com>

Subject: EPA comments on Tierra Fish Data Report

Attached EPA's comments on the Fish Data Report. Thanks, eugenia

Your message is ready to be sent with the following file or link attachments:

2016-11-29 Tierra Fish Data Report Comments NBSA-EPA.docx